

Contents

Classical Composition

Refutation and Confirmation Stages

Teaching Guidelines	4
Grading Sheets	6
Definition of Terms	11
Introduction to Refutation and Confirmation	12
Lesson 1: Paraphrase of Aphthonius' Refutation	14
Lesson 2: Paraphrase of Aphthonius' Confirmation	28
Lesson 3: Refutation of Giufà and the Judge	38
Lesson 4: Confirmation of Giufà and the Judge	50
Lesson 5: Refutation of Chico and the Crane	60
Lesson 6: Confirmation of Chico and the Crane	72
Lesson 7: Refutation of Daedalus and Icarus	82
Lesson 8: Confirmation of Daedalus and Icarus	96
Lesson 9: Refutation of Andrew Jackson and the Battle of New Orleans	106
Lesson 10: Confirmation of Andrew Jackson and the Battle of New Orleans	120
Lesson 11: Refutation of The Story of William Tell	130
Lesson 12: Confirmation of The Story of William Tell	142
Lesson 13: Refutation of George Washington and the Apple Tree	152
Lesson 14: Confirmation of George Washington and the Apple Tree	166
Lesson 15: Refutation of The Rose	176
Lesson 16: Confirmation of The Rose	188
Lesson 17: Refutation of Andreas Hofer	196
Lesson 18: Confirmation of Andreas Hofer	208

Appendix

Figures of Description With Examples	218
Figures of Speech With Examples	223

LESSON 3

The Narrative

1. Read the story aloud; it may be read again, aloud or silently.
2. Highlight and explain key words:
 - » *Giufà* - [yoof-a] a character in Sicilian tales
 - » *herb* - a plant used for flavor, scent, etc.
 - » *exclaim* - to cry out loudly
 - » *officers of justice* - policemen
 - » *credit* - trust in a buyer's intention to pay
 - » *pronounce* - to utter formally or solemnly
 - » *sentence* - a judge's decision on punishment

3. Ask: "What are the main acts of this story?"

[Ex] Act I: *Giufà*
 Act II: Thieves
 Act III: Meat
 Act IV: Selling the Meat
 Act V: The Judge

4. Call on students to narrate the story from memory.
5. Discuss details about the story.
 - » What does *Giufà* exclaim about the moon?
 [Ex] "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!"
 - » How does *Giufà* upset the thieves?
 [Ex] They feared the officers of justice were coming.
 - » What does his mother do with the meat?
 [Ex] The next day his mother sold the meat.
 - » What does his mother tell him about it?
 [Ex] "Yes, I sold it to the flies on credit."
 - » What does the judge sentence on the flies?
 [Ex] "Wherever you see them, you may kill them."
6. Ask: "What is the truth this story attempts to demonstrate?"

[Ex] Be just in your dealings with everyone.

[Ex] A mocker will suffer.

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Students need to know the story.
- » Focus on relevant details.

Aphthonius' Model

1. Review Aphthonius' model.
2. Ask: "What is the purpose of a Refutation?"
 [Ex] to refute the poets, a particular story, or the truth or Recognition of a story
3. Ask: "What are the paragraphs?"
 - » Discredit, Exposition, Unclearity, Implausibility, Impossibility, Inconsistency, Impropriety, Inexpediency, and Epilogue
4. Call on students to define each kind of argument.

Lesson 3: Refutation of *Giufà and the Judge*

The Narrative

Read the narrative, noting the Narrative Components.

One day *Giufà* went out to gather herbs, and it was night before he returned. On his way back, the moon rose through the clouds, and *Giufà* sat down on a stone and watched the moon appear and disappear behind the clouds, and he exclaimed constantly, "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!"

Now there were near the way some thieves who were skinning a calf which they had stolen, and when they heard "It appears, it sets!" they feared that the officers of justice were coming, so they ran away and left the meat.

When *Giufà* saw the thieves running away, he went to see what it was and found the calf skinned. He took his knife and cut off flesh enough to fill his sack and went home. When he arrived there, his mother asked him why he came so late. He said it was because he was bringing some meat which she was to sell the next day, and the money was to be kept for him. The next day his mother sent him into the country and sold the meat.

In the evening *Giufà* returned and asked his mother, "Did you sell the meat?"

"Yes, I sold it to the flies on credit."

"When will they give you the money?"

"When they get it."

A week passed, and the flies brought no money, so *Giufà* went to the judge and said to him, "Sir, I want justice. I sold the flies meat on credit, and they have not come to pay me."

The judge said, "I pronounce this sentence on them: Wherever you see them, you may kill them."

Just then a fly lighted on the judge's nose, and *Giufà* dealt it such a blow that he broke the judge's head.

1. Discredit

This paragraph begins the refutation by discrediting the author or the story.

1. Introduction

Write a general statement of discredit about the author or the story.

Write your answer: It is fruitless to contradict great storytellers, but they force us to do so by their invention of such silly and harmful tales.

2. Discredits

Write at least three discredits about the story or the author.

Write your answer: The author of this tale has forsworn honor. He has not set forth good examples of behavior or inspired men to live bravely and honestly.

3. Thesis

Write a sentence that tells what this essay is about. Include the name of the story.

Write your answer: Though it would be better to altogether avoid the tale of "*Giufà and the Judge*," it is my responsibility to make clear to all how spectacularly it fails to be a story worth one's time.

1. Discredit

This paragraph discredits the story or author.

INTRODUCTION

1. Read the directions; you may refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "It is pointless to contradict the poets, but they themselves provoke us to contradict them ..."
2. Ask: "Who are we discrediting generally?"
 [Ex] poets, storytellers, makers of tall tales
3. Ask: "How will you discredit them?"
 [Ex] Say that they would not listen to reproof or advice, e.g., "It is pointless to contradict the poets."
 [Ex] Say their works are so bad that it would be wrong not to refute them, e.g., "They provoke us to contradict them."
4. Call for oral answers, then written.

Rough Draft

Combine the three elements above into a paragraph. Add anemographia.

It is fruitless to contradict great storytellers, but they force us to do so by their invention of such silly and harmful tales. The author of this tale has forsworn honor. He has not set forth good examples of behavior or inspired men to live bravely and honestly. Though it would be better to altogether avoid the tale of “*Giufà and the Judge*,” it is my responsibility to make clear to all how spectacularly it fails to be a story worth one’s time, *and should be swept away with the whirlwind of truth*.

2. Exposition

This paragraph retells the story being refuted.

1. Narrative

Identify the Narrative Components and then form them into a narrative.

1. Recognition: taking troubles to a judge; moon passing behind clouds
2. Reversal: a judge, who should be a beacon of honor and justice, lies to and mocks Giufà
3. Suffering: terror; mother lying to son; broken nose
4. Agents: Giufà; thieves; mother; judge; (flies)
5. Action: Giufà’s foolishness leads to ridicule but allows him to retaliate without harm
6. Time: once upon a time; night; daytime
7. Place: peasant village in Italy
8. Manner: (these match actions given above) dutifully/in a silly way; with fright; observantly; greedily; dishonestly; jocularly; ridiculously
9. Cause: to show the consequences of mockery

Write your answer: The story goes that a fool named Giufà was gathering herbs late at night when he noticed the moon disappearing and reappearing behind the clouds. “It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!” he shouted. Some nearby thieves who were skinning a cow they had stolen, mistaking the voice of Giufà for that of the police, fled in terror. Giufà, finding the meat they left behind in their hurry, put the stolen booty in his bag and took it home to his mother to sell. His mother went to the market the next day and sold the meat, keeping the money for herself. When Giufà inquired about the sale, she fabricated that she had sold it to the flies on credit. When a week went by without money from the flies, Giufà went to court to try and settle the matter. The judge listened to Giufà’s story, and, making light of his troubles, jocularly told him that if he ever saw the flies, he could kill them. Just then, a fly landed on the judge’s nose, and Giufà, taking the judge’s word seriously, proceeded to kill the fly, smacking the judge soundly on his nose and breaking it.

Refutation of *Giufà and the Judge*

39

DISCREDITS

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius’ example:
 - » “they should have had no respect for the gods ... I am pained when any of the gods is treated with contempt, but especially Apollo”
2. Ask: “What virtues should a story inspire that this story does not?” (e.g., honor, courage, honesty)
3. Allow oral answers before students write.

THESIS

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius’ example:
 - [Ex] “These poets have told unacceptable tales about Apollo and Daphne.”
2. Ask: “What story are we refuting? (use Periphrasis)”
 - [Ex] the tale of the simpleton Giufà who asked the judge for justice
3. Ask: “What will you say about the story?”
 - [Ex] It fails to be a story worth one’s time.
4. Have students write an answer.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements (Introduction, Discredits, and Thesis) into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include anemographia, describing wind:

[Ex] It fails to be a story worth one’s time, *and should be swept away with the whirlwind of truth*.

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Answers/examples in this Teacher Guide are for your help.
- » Students should think and write their answers, not yours.
- » If students answer orally, other students can benefit.
- » Allow for fun balanced with proper taste.

2. Exposition

This paragraph briefly retells the story.

NARRATIVE

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius’ example; discuss its brevity:
 - » “Daphne, they say, was the offspring of Earth and Ladon, and excelling others in beauty she made the Pythian her lover. Loving her, he pursued her; pursuing her, he did not catch her, but Earth received her daughter and gave forth a flower bearing the same name as the maiden. He crowned himself with her in her new form, and the plant is displayed as a crown at the Pythian tripod because of his desire for the mortal maiden, and the shoot is made a token of his art.”
2. Ask: “What is the Recognition?”
 - [Ex] A mocker will suffer.
3. Ask: “What is the Reversal?”
 - [Ex] A judge mocks Giufà and suffers for it.
4. Ask: “What Suffering occurs?”
 - [Ex] The judge suffers a broken nose.
5. Answer the rest of the components in the same fashion.
6. Call on students to narrate a paraphrase of the story.
7. Have students write a brief paraphrase.

LESSON 3

TRANSITION

1. Say: "Now that we have briefly retold the story to our audience, we need to remind them about what we are doing: we are refuting *this* story."
2. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Such are the tales they tell; it is easy to put them to the test, as follows."
3. Ask: "What will you say about the story?"

Ex It is easy to put it to the test.
4. Have students write a paraphrase.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements (Narrative, Transition) into a paragraph.
 2. Remind them to include astrothesia, describing stars:

Ex Giufà was gathering herbs under a *starless sky* late at night.
- +TEACHER TIPS
- » Walk around and help individuals.
 - » Ask students to read Rough Drafts aloud when finished; praise them and have other students praise them.

3. Unclarity

Here we argue that some fact from the story is unclear.

The unclear fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Daphne was the offspring of Earth and Ladon: what proof does she have of her birth?"
2. Ask: "What fact will we argue is unclear?" (Giufà said about the moon, "It appears! It sets!")
3. Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"

Ex Clouds scudding across the moon (cause) does not clearly lead to saying that the moon was rising and setting (effect).

2. Transition

Write a transition sentence.

Write your answer: This story, "Giufà and the Judge," like the others the poets tell, is easy to put to the test.

Rough Draft

Retell the narrative to your audience using the Narrative Components, and then add the Transition. Add astrothesia.

The story goes that a fool named Giufà was gathering herbs under a *starless sky* late at night when he noticed the moon disappearing and reappearing behind the clouds. "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!" he shouted. Some nearby thieves who were skinning a cow they had stolen, mistaking the voice of Giufà for that of the police, fled in terror. Giufà, finding the meat they left behind in their hurry, put the stolen booty in his bag and took it home to his mother to sell. His mother went to the market the next day and sold the meat, keeping the money for herself. When Giufà inquired about the sale, she fabricated that she had sold it to the flies on credit. When a week went by without money from the flies, Giufà went to court to try and settle the matter. The judge listened to Giufà's story, and, making light of his troubles, jocularly told him that if he ever saw the flies, he could kill them. Just then, a fly landed on the judge's nose, and Giufà, taking the judge's word seriously, proceeded to kill the fly, smacking the judge soundly on his nose and breaking it. This story, like the others the poets tell, is easy to put to the test.

3. Unclarity

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is unclear. To be "unclear" means the cause could not produce the effect.

One day Giufà went out to gather herbs, and it was night before he returned. On his way back, the moon rose through the clouds, and Giufà sat down on a stone and watched the moon appear and disappear behind the clouds, and he exclaimed constantly, "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!"

1. Rhetorical Question

State the fact you will be disputing, then ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the fact.

Write your answer: We are told Giufà yelled under the moon, "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!" But how could clouds blowing across the moon lead to saying it rose and set?

2. Statement

Tell why the fact you are disputing is unclear.

Write your answer: If the moon in the sky is merely being blocked by clouds every couple of seconds, then it could not possibly effect the illusion of waxing and waning on the horizon.

40

Lesson 3

4. Ask: "What rhetorical question will you ask to imply the unclarity?"

Ex How could clouds scudding across the moon cause one to say that it was rising and setting?

5. Call for oral answers, then written.

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "She was human; theirs is a different nature."
2. Ask: "How can you turn your Rhetorical Question into a statement?"

Ex It is unclear why Giufà said the moon was waxing and waning on the horizon when it was only being passed over by clouds.
3. Have students write an answer.

3. Counter Argument

Quote an opponent's possible counter argument.

Write your answer: One might say, "Giufà was only commenting on what he was seeing."

4. Answer Counter Argument

Give an answer to the counter argument.

Write your answer: Not even a person as simple of mind as Giufà could think that the moon rises and sets more than once a night, and so very quickly.

5. Answer Counter Argument

Give a second answer to the counter argument.

Write your answer: A person would not mistake clouds blowing across the view of the moon for the moon following its long path across the sky when it rises and sets.

6. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

Write your answer: Either the structure of the cosmos rearranged itself while Giufà was watching, or he did not have a firm grasp on reality.

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add onomatopoeia.

We are told Giufà *howled* under the moon, "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!" But how could clouds blowing across the moon lead to saying it rose and set? If the moon is merely being blocked by clouds every couple of seconds, then it could not possibly effect the illusion of waxing and waning on the horizon. One might say, "Giufà was only commenting on what he was seeing." Not even a person as simple of mind as Giufà could think that the moon rises and sets more than once a night, and so very quickly. How could a person mistake clouds blowing across the view of the moon for the moon following its long path across the sky when it rises and sets? These two events do not look the same at all. Either the structure of the cosmos rearranged themselves while Giufà was watching, or he did not have a firm grasp on reality.

Refutation of *Giufà and the Judge*

41

ANSWERCOUNTERARGUMENT
(PART 2)

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "What do they call a marriage of river and earth? A wedding is for sentient beings, of whom the earth is not one."
2. Ask: "How else may we answer our opponent?"
 - [Ex] The scudding of clouds is quick, but the orbit of the moon is much more gradual.
3. Have students write an answer.

DILEMMA

1. Say: "A dilemma is offering a choice between two (equally unfavorable) alternatives."
 - [Ex] Either your client is guilty of perjury, or of murder.
2. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "So either Daphne must be classed among streams or Ladon must be reckoned a man."
3. Ask: "What choice may we offer our opponent?"
 - [Ex] Either simpletons have no notion of the moon and its movements or the moon's orbit appears faster than the wind-spiced clouds.
4. Have students write an answer.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include onomatopoeia:
 - [Ex] We are told Giufà *howled* under the moon.

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Walk around and help individuals.
- » Students may object about refuting certain aspects of the story that seem right:
 - [Ex] Giufà may have just been playing a game with the moon rather than literally thinking it was rising and setting.
- » Assure that they will get a chance to confirm such aspects in the next lesson, but in Refutation, we must take the perspective of a refuter.

COUNTER ARGUMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "How did Ladon have intercourse with Earth? Flooding her with his waters?"
2. Ask: "How might an opponent answer your rhetorical question?"
 - [Ex] "Giufà was only commenting on what he was seeing."
3. Have students write an answer.

ANSWER COUNTER ARGUMENT (PART 1)

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Then all rivers can be called Earth's husbands, since all flood her. And if a human came forth from a river, then a river can come from humans; for descendants disclose their ancestry."
2. Ask: "How may we answer our opponent?"
 - [Ex] If so, then he had never seen the moon before nor known about it.
3. Have students write an answer.

LESSON 3

4. Implausibility

Here we argue that some fact from the story is implausible, or unlikely.

The implausible fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

TRANSITION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "But let it be so; let us grant to the poets that Daphne was the child of Earth and Ladon. When the girl was born, by whom was she raised?"
2. Ask: "What may we ask our readers to do?"

[Ex] Overlook the fact that Giufà's exclamation about the moon is unclear.
3. Ask: "What fact will we argue is implausible?" (The thieves abandoned their booty.)
4. Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"

[Ex] It is implausible that the thieves would have left their stolen goods.
5. Ask: "What rhetorical question will you ask to imply the implausibility?"

[Ex] Why would the thieves have so quickly abandoned their stolen goods?
6. Call for oral answers, then written.

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "For even if I grant the birth, the rearing is implausible."
2. Ask: "How can you turn your Transition into a statement?"

[Ex] For even if we concede that Giufà yelled at the moon, still it is implausible that the thieves discarded their plunder.
3. Have students write an answer.

4. Implausibility

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is unlikely to have occurred.

Now there were near the way some thieves who were skinning a calf which they had stolen, and when they heard "It appears, it sets!" they feared that the officers of justice were coming, so they ran away and left the meat.

1. Transition

Ask readers to grant the previous point, and then ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the fact you will be disputing.

Write your answer: But let us grant that Giufà actually yelled such remarkable things at the moon.

Why would the thieves have so quickly abandoned their stolen goods?

2. Statement

Paraphrase your previous concession and state the implausibility.

Write your answer: For even if we concede that Giufà would yell such crazy things, still it is implausible that the thieves would so carelessly discard their plunder.

3. Rhetorical Question

Paraphrase #2 with a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the implausible action.

Write your answer: Why would the thieves face the threat of punishment to steal the calf, only to give it up at a small sign of trouble?

4. Counter Argument

Quote an opponent's possible counter argument.

Write your answer: "The thieves were terrified by Giufà's yelling and sprinted away without a second thought for their stolen meat," one might say.

5. Answer Counter Argument

Answer the counter argument in the form of a rhetorical question.

Write your answer: Would hardened criminals so quickly forget their courage after all the time and effort it took to pull off their theft successfully?

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Where did the girl live?"
2. Ask: "How can you turn your statement into a question?"

[Ex] Why would the thieves discard their plunder?
3. Have students write an answer.

COUNTER ARGUMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "By Zeus, with her father."
2. Ask: "How might an opponent answer your rhetorical question?"

[Ex] "The thieves were terrified by Giufà's yelling."
3. Have students write an answer.

6. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

Write your answer: Either the thieves enjoyed working hard for no profit, or they were experienced criminals who spontaneously lost their nerve.

7. Counter Argument

Quote a second possible counter argument from an opponent.

Write your answer: Some might insist: "The thieves feared for their lives when they heard Giufà's bellowing."

8. Dilemma

Answer the counter argument with an either/or sentence.

Write your answer: So either laws in the olden days were so strict that getting caught stealing was punishable by death, or the thieves would never have abandoned their booty at the sound of Giufà's voice.

9. Statement

Write a paraphrase of your general argument.

Write your answer: People who are intent on doing evil are not easily dismayed; they let nothing stop them.

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add anemographia.

But let us grant that Giufà actually yelled such remarkable things at the moon. Why would the thieves have so quickly abandoned their stolen goods? For even if we concede that Giufà would yell such crazy things, still it is implausible that the thieves would so carelessly discard their plunder. Why would the thieves face the threat of punishment to steal the calf, only to *flit off like leaves on a strong gust of wind* at a small sign of trouble? "The thieves were terrified by Giufà's yelling and sprinted away without a second thought for their stolen meat," one might say. Would hardened criminals so quickly forget their courage after all the time and effort it took to pull off their theft successfully? Either the thieves enjoyed working hard for no profit, or they were experienced criminals who spontaneously lost their nerve. Some might insist: "The thieves feared for their lives when they heard Giufà's bellowing." So either laws in the olden days were so strict that getting caught stealing was punishable by death, or the thieves would never have abandoned their booty at the sound of Giufà's voice. People who are intent on doing evil are not easily dismayed; they let nothing stop them.

Refutation of Giufà and the Judge

43

COUNTER ARGUMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "But the girl lived beneath the earth with her mother."
2. Ask: "How else might an opponent answer your previous rhetorical question?"
[Ex] "The thieves feared for their lives."
3. Have students write an answer.

DILEMMA

1. Ask: "What choice may we offer our opponent?"
[Ex] Either stealing was punishable by death, or Giufà's exclamations were deadly.
2. Have students write an answer.

STATEMENT

1. Ask: "How can we summarize our argument?"
[Ex] The thieves would probably not have been afraid of Giufà's yelling because they were criminals who had worked hard for their loot and did not fear punishment.
2. Ask: "How can we state this summary in general terms?"
[Ex] It is unlikely for people intent on doing evil to be easily frightened.
3. Have students write an answer.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include anemographia, describing wind:
[Ex] Why would thieves *flit off like leaves on a strong gust of wind* at a small sign of trouble?

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Walk around and help individuals.
- » Give a 30-second grammar lesson if you notice a pervasive mistake.
- [Ex] Use quotation marks to enclose a direct quotation, e.g., Some might say, "The thieves feared for their lives."

ANSWER COUNTER ARGUMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "What human can live in a river?"
2. Ask: "How may we answer our opponent?"
[Ex] The thieves would not have left their hard-earned loot out of fear.
3. Say: "Write your answer in the form of a question."
[Ex] Would hardened criminals so easily leave their hard-earned loot?

DILEMMA

1. Say: "A dilemma is offering a choice between two (equally unfavorable) alternatives."
[Ex] Either your client is guilty of perjury, or of murder.
2. Ask: "What choice may we offer our opponent?"
[Ex] Either thieves work for no profit, or they spontaneously lose their nerve.
3. Have students write an answer.

LESSON 3

5. Impossibility

Here we argue that some fact from the story is impossible.

The impossible fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

TRANSITION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "If you will, let us grant this, too, to the poets."
2. Ask: "What may we ask our readers to do?"
[Ex] Concede that the thieves left their loot.
3. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "How did a god love and belie his nature by falling in love?"
2. Ask: "What fact will we argue is impossible?" (Meat soiled with dirt was purchased.)
3. Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"
[Ex] It is impossible that the meat was bought.
4. Ask: "What rhetorical question will you ask to imply the impossibility?"
[Ex] How is it possible that anyone would buy the rotten meat?
5. Have students write an answer.

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "Love is the most burdensome of all things, and it is impious to ascribe the worst evils to the gods."
2. Say: "This statement is general, meaning it refers to no particular person or situation."
3. Ask: "How can you turn the rhetorical question into a general statement?"
[Ex] No one would buy soiled, rancid meat.
4. Have students write an answer.

5. Impossibility

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is impossible.

When Giufà saw the thieves running away, he went to see what it was and found the calf skinned. He took his knife and cut off flesh enough to fill his sack and went home. When he arrived there, his mother asked him why he came so late. He said it was because he was bringing some meat which she was to sell the next day, and the money was to be kept for him. The next day his mother sent him into the country and sold the meat.

1. Transition

Ask readers to grant the previous point.

Write your answer: But we will concede that these criminals abandoned their profit.

2. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on a particular fact from the story and shows a logical contradiction.

Write your answer: Then, given that people only eat fresh, unspoiled meat, why would they purchase rancid meat from Giufà's mother?

3. Statement

Answer the rhetorical question with a general statement that is a paraphrase of #2.

Write your answer: When consumers see that the meat for sale is putrid and rotting, they will not buy it.

4. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "If ... then ..." ask a general rhetorical question that is a loose paraphrase of #3.

Write your answer: If consumers see that the beef they are about to purchase is maggoty, then will they not take their business elsewhere?

5. Statement

Flatly contradict #2-4 with particulars from the story to show that it is impossible.

Write your answer: Giufà's mother did not sell the meat, for she could find no one willing to buy such inedible food.

44

Lesson 3

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "For if the gods are subject to all diseases, how will they differ from mortals? But if they bear love, which is worst of all, why are they free from the rest when they bear the most grievous?"
2. Ask: "How can you paraphrase your previous statement as a rhetorical question in the 'If ... then ...' form?"
[Ex] If meat is rotten and covered with dirt, then will anyone buy it?
3. Have students write an answer.

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "But his nature does not know passion, nor was the Pythian seen as a lover."
2. Say: "How can we flatly contradict the story?"
[Ex] Giufà's mother did not sell the rotten meat because no one would buy it.
3. Have students write an answer.

Syllogism (#6-9 are optional if you have not studied Logic)

Create a syllogism using one of the nouns you used in #2. Use the syllogism to complete #6-9.

major premise: All meat covered in dirt is inedible.
minor premise: No inedible things are purchased by people.
conclusion: Therefore, no thing purchased by people is meat covered in dirt.

6. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that includes the conclusion of your syllogism.

Write your answer: Why would anyone purchase meat covered in dirt?

7. Statement

State the major or minor premise.

Write your answer: All meat covered in grime has an acrid, bitter crunch.

8. Rhetorical Question

Paraphrase the conclusion as a rhetorical question.

Write your answer: Why would anyone spend their hard-earned money on such filth?

9. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that condemns the author and paraphrases the conclusion of the syllogism.

Write your answer: Does the author think we are so gullible as to believe that someone would actually purchase disgusting meat?

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add onomatopoeia.

But we will concede that these criminals abandoned their profit. Then, given that people only eat fresh, unspoiled meat, why would they purchase rancid meat from Giufà's mother? When consumers see that meat for sale is putrid and rotting, they will not buy it. If consumers see that the beef they are about to purchase is maggoty, then will they not take their business elsewhere? Giufà's mother did not sell the meat, for she could find no one willing to buy such inedible food. Why would anyone purchase meat covered in dirt? All meat covered in grime has an acrid, bitter crunch. Why would anyone spend their hard-earned money on such filth? Does the author think we are so gullible as to believe that someone would actually purchase *squishy*, disgusting meat?

Refutation of Giufà and the Judge

45

SYLLOGISM

The syllogism is optional for students who have not studied logic.

1. Read the directions; refer to the sixth paragraph in Aphthonius' model:
 » "When the Pythian was chasing the girl, how did he come second to a mortal? Men excel women; do women, then, outclass gods? Does what is lesser among mortals overcome gods?"
2. Ask: "What nouns occur in this part of the story?"
 (*meat, dirt, sellers, buyers*)
3. Ask: "What do we conclude about these nouns?"
 [Ex] Buyers do not buy dirty meat.
4. Have students write a conclusion on the third line.
5. Ask: "What is the major and minor premise that lead to the conclusion?" (Major: All dirty meat is inedible. Minor: Nothing inedible is purchased by people.)
6. Have students write the major premise on the first line and the minor premise on the second line.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 » "When the Pythian was chasing the girl, how did he come second to a mortal?"
2. Ask: "How can we turn our conclusion into a question?"
 [Ex] Why would anyone purchase dirty meat?
3. Have students write an answer.

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 » "Men excel women"
2. Say: "State the major premise."
 [Ex] All meat covered in grime is inedible.
3. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 » "Do women, then, outclass gods?"
2. Ask: "How can we again turn the conclusion into a question?"
 [Ex] How is it possible that anyone would spend their money on filthy food?
3. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 » "Does what is lesser among mortals overcome gods?"
2. Ask: "How can we condemn the author?"
 [Ex] The author must think we are gullible.
3. Say: "Turn this into a question."
 [Ex] Does the author think we are so gullible as to believe this impossibility?
4. Have students write an answer.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include onomatopoeia:
 [Ex] *squishy*, disgusting meat

LESSON 3

6. Inconsistency

Here we argue that some fact from the story is inconsistent, or unjust.

The inconsistent fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "Why did the mother receive her daughter when she fled?"
2. Ask: "What fact will we argue is inconsistent?" (Giufà's mother lied to him.)
3. Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"
Ex It is inconsistent that Giufà's mother lied to him.
4. Ask: "What 'why' rhetorical question will you ask to imply the inconsistency?"
Ex Why would a mother be dishonest with her son?
5. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "Is marriage a worthless thing? Then how did she herself become a mother?"
2. Ask: "How can you paraphrase your previous rhetorical question in the 'If ... then ...' form?"
Ex If it is inconsistent for a mother to be dishonest with her son, then how could Giufà's mother lie to him?
Ex If it is consistent for a mother to be honest with her son, then how could Giufà's mother lie to him?
3. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "Or a good thing? Then why did she deprive her daughter of what is fine?"

6. Inconsistency

This paragraph shows how a person in the story acts inconsistently, or unjustly.

In the evening Giufà returned and asked his mother, "Did you sell the meat?"
"Yes, I sold it to the flies on credit."
"When will they give you the money?"
"When they get it."

1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular inconsistent action in the story.

Write your answer: Why would a mother be completely dishonest with her son?

2. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question in the form of "If ... then ..." that expounds on #1.

Write your answer: If a mother is supposed to love her child unconditionally, then how could Giufà have a mother who lies and swindles him?

3. Rhetorical Question

State a general truth, and then ask a rhetorical question that points out an inconsistency with this truth in the story.

Write your answer: Mothers are entrusted with raising a child in love and grace. How, then, could Giufà's mother trick him with such malice?

4. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

Write your answer: Either she is a heartless mother, or Giufà is not really her son.

2. Ask: "What is a general truth about consistency/justice that is violated in the story?"
Ex It is consistent for a mother to raise a child in love and grace.
3. Ask: "What rhetorical question can you ask to imply that this truth was violated in the story?"
Ex How could Giufà's mother trick him so unlovingly?
4. Have students write an answer.

DILEMMA

1. Say: "A dilemma is offering a choice between two (equally unfavorable) alternatives."
Ex Either your client is guilty of perjury, or of murder.
2. Ask: "What choice may we offer an opponent?"
Ex Either she is a heartless mother, or Giufà is not really her son.
3. Have students write an answer.

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add onomatopoeia.

Why would a mother be completely dishonest with her son? If a mother is supposed to love her child unconditionally, then how could Giufà have a mother who *murmurs* such lies and swindles him? Mothers are entrusted with raising a child in love and grace. How, then, could Giufà's mother trick him with such malice? Either she is a heartless mother, or Giufà is not really her son.

7. Impropriety

This paragraph shows how a person in the story lacks moral integrity or honor.

A week passed, and the flies brought no money, so Giufà went to the judge and said to him, "Sir, I want justice. I sold the flies meat on credit, and they have not come to pay me."
The judge said, "I pronounce this sentence on them: Wherever you see them, you may kill them."

1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular improper action in the story.

Write your answer: Why would the judge perpetuate the mother's deceit, hindering justice by refusing to tell Giufà the truth?

2. Rhetorical Question

State a general truth, and then ask a rhetorical question in the form of "If ... then ..." that points out an impropriety in the character in the story.

Write your answer: If judges are meant to be beacons of justice and honor, then how could a magistrate refuse to help Giufà find the truth?

3. Statement

Paraphrase "2 in an "If ... then ..." statement, but reverse the order and begin with "then."

Write your answer: Then the judge's treatment of Giufà was contemptible and dishonest, if indeed a judge is under obligation to advocate truth and protect justice.

Refutation of *Giufà and the Judge*

47

ROUGH DRAFT

- Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
- Remind them to include onomatopoeia.

[Ex] a mother *speaking* lies > a mother *murmuring* lies

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Walk around and help individuals.
- » Dilemma may cause confusion for some students, so you may decide to compose this part together, ensuring that the dilemma is a choice between two equally unfavorable alternatives.

7. Impropriety

Here we argue that some fact from the story is improper, or dishonorable.

The improper fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

- Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Why did Earth act in conflict with her own deeds?"
- Ask: "What fact will we argue is improper?" (The judge continued the mother's deceit.)
- Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"

[Ex] It is improper that the judge continued the mother's deceit.
- Ask: "What 'why' rhetorical question will you ask to imply the impropriety?"

[Ex] Why would the judge continue the mother's deceit?
- Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

- Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "She displeased the Pythian by saving her daughter; did she then try to please him by bringing her back?"
- Ask: "What is a general truth about propriety that is violated in the story?"

[Ex] It is proper for a judge to seek justice.
- Ask: "What 'If ... then ...' rhetorical question can you ask to imply that this truth was violated in the story?"

[Ex] If it is proper for a judge to seek justice, then how could the judge refuse to help Giufà get true justice?
- Have students write an answer.

STATEMENT

- Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "She should not have tried to please if she wanted to displease."
- Ask: "How can you turn your question above into a 'Then ... if ...' statement?"

[Ex] Then the judge's acts were improper, if it is proper for a judge to seek justice.
- Have students write an answer.

LESSON 3

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include *aequipollentia*:

[Ex] judges are *meant to tell the truth* >
judges are *not meant to tell lies*

+TEACHER TIPS

- » Walk around and help individuals.
- » Give a 30-second lesson on the difference between consistency and propriety:

[Ex] A person is consistent if he treats others as he should. A person is proper if he acts in a way that merits praise.

[Ex] Consistency has to do with innocence vs. guilt. Propriety has to do with honor vs. shame.

8. Inexpediency

Here we argue that some fact from the story is inexpedient.

The inexpedient fact is found in the selection; read it aloud.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "Why was the god crowned with laurel at the tripods?"
2. Ask: "What fact will we argue is inexpedient?" (Giufà hit the judge's nose.)
3. Ask: "What will we imply about this fact?"

[Ex] It is inexpedient that Giufà hit the judge.
4. Ask: "What 'why' rhetorical question will you ask to imply the inexpediency?"

[Ex] Why would Giufà hit the judge?
5. Have students write an answer.

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add *aequipollentia*.

Why would the judge perpetuate the mother's deceit, hindering justice by refusing to tell Giufà the truth? If judges are *not meant to tell lies*, then how could a magistrate refuse to help Giufà find the truth? Then the judge's treatment of Giufà was contemptible and dishonest, if indeed a judge is under obligation to advocate truth and protect justice.

8. Inexpediency

This paragraph shows how a person's action in the story was not helpful or useful.

Just then a fly lighted on the judge's nose, and Giufà dealt it such a blow that he broke the judge's head.

1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular inexpedient action in the story.

Write your answer: Why would Giufà make a bad situation worse by attacking a magistrate?

2. Statement

State a general truth that relates to #1.

Write your answer: A person who graciously asks for his pleas to be considered will be heard, but acting disrespectfully in court invites punishment.

3. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "How then ..." ask a rhetorical question that expands on the question in #1.

Write your answer: How then could Giufà go before the law looking for help, and then aggressively assault the one who could help him?

48

Lesson 3

STATEMENT

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "The shoot was a symbol of pleasure, but the power of prophecy is a sign of virtue"
2. Ask: "What is a general truth about expediency that is violated in the story?"

[Ex] It is inexpedient to hit a judge who has the power to punish as well as help.
3. Have students write an answer.

RHETORICAL QUESTION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
 - » "How then did the Pythian connect what by nature cannot be joined?"
2. Ask: "What 'How then' rhetorical question can you ask to imply that the general truth was violated in the story?"

[Ex] How then could Giufà ask the judge for help and then hit him on the nose?
3. Have students write an answer.

4. Exclamation

Express disbelief that someone would act so inexpediently.

Write your answer: Seriously?

5. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

Write your answer: Either Giufà came before the judge with the explicit purpose of getting himself jailed, or he was mad.

Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add enallage.

Why would Giufà make a bad situation worse by attacking a magistrate? A person who graciously asks for his pleas to be considered will be heard, but acting disrespectfully in court *is asking to be punished*. Why would Giufà go before the law looking for help, and then aggressively assault the one who could help him? Seriously? Either Giufà came before the judge with the explicit purpose of getting himself jailed, or he was mad.

9. Epilogue

This paragraph concludes the essay.

Epilogue

Conclude briefly by restating the discredit and challenging the audience.

Write your answer: For all these reasons we have no choice but to dismiss this story of "Giufà and the Judge" and its storytellers.

Final Draft

Proofread the rough drafts above, and correct errors in grammar, spelling, and punctuation. On a separate sheet of paper, combine the corrected rough drafts into the form of a final draft.

Refutation of Giufà and the Judge

49

DILEMMA

1. Say: "A dilemma is offering a choice between two (equally unfavorable) alternatives."

☐ Either your client is guilty of perjury, or of murder.

2. Ask: "What choice may we offer an opponent?"

☐ Either Giufà wanted punishment, or he was a lunatic.

3. Have students write an answer.

ROUGH DRAFT

1. Have students combine the above elements into a paragraph.
2. Remind them to include enallage:

☐ asks for *punishment* >
asks to be *punished*

+TEACHER TIPS

» Logos, Ethos, and Pathos are essential elements of rhetoric; do not skip over Pathos, or emotional appeal. Inform students about the various kinds of emotions one can express and incite in one's audience.

☐ Emotions defined in Aristotle's *Rhetoric*: anger, calmness, friendliness, enmity, fear, confidence, shame, shamelessness, kindness, unkindness, pity, indignation, envy, emulation

☐ Basic: mad, glad, sad, afraid, ashamed

9. Epilogue

Here we end our argument.

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:

» "Let there be an end to the poets, lest I seem to be decrying them."

2. Ask: "How can we conclude?"

☐ We must forsake this story and its author.

3. Have students write an answer.

Final Draft

Use the Grading Sheet to grade. Require students to:

» Include their name in the title.

☐ *Refutation of [Story] by [Name]*

» Indent paragraphs.

» Write on every other line.

» Underline required figures.

EXCLAMATION

1. Read the directions; refer to Aphthonius' example:
» "What?"
2. Ask: "What emotion expresses how one should respond to this inexpediency?"

☐ contempt, scorn, mockery

☐ disbelief, confusion, bewilderment

3. Ask: "How can we express this emotion in a short exclamation?"

☐ Seriously?

☐ Really?

☐ This crazy behavior is ridiculous!

4. Have students write an answer.